Metaphor as Renewal: Re-Imagining Our Professional Selves

CANDIDA GILLIS AND CHERYL L. JOHNSON

These are the metaphors of two students in English education programs who have imagined what lies ahead of them. They are about to become teachers, and their images of themselves, while joyful, are tempered with caution.

As beginning teachers, many of us were told, “Don’t smile until Christmas.” We believed early on that to enter an English classroom as an army sergeant would guarantee a well-ordered environment and respectful, disciplined students. Others of us felt like Santa Claus, pulling treasures of great literature from a magical bag for the starry-eyed, eager readers who sat at our feet. How we see

ourselves as teachers of English depends on many things: culture, gender, and experiences. The metaphors we construct to describe our teaching lives arise from the teachers we have known, from our knowledge of pedagogy, and from our relationships to literature, language, and writing. Because they reveal our educational values, beliefs, and principles, they contain information essential to our growth as professionals.

The work of Joseph C. Fischer and Anne Kiefer, and of Sarah Efron and Pamela Bolotin Joseph on teacher self-image illuminates the power of metaphor as a tool for exploring our attitudes and beliefs. In “Reflections in a Mirror: Teacher-Generated Metaphors from Self and Others,” Efron and Bolotin Joseph show that “metaphor allows teachers both intuitively and rationally to engage in a reflective process about their personal notions of their roles in schools” (57). Through the creative use of metaphor teachers can “portray their personal philosophies of what teaching is, their own vision of their goals as teachers, and their sense of classroom realities” (57).

These studies and the research of Anne Ruggles Gere, Sharon Pugh, and others advocate metaphorical thinking as a means of deepening our awareness as educators. Their views have been confirmed in our own workshops and classes, where we, too, have found the strategy a rich one for helping people clarify problems in their teaching situations and identify directions for change. Educational reform movements and their accompanying pressures—to adjust curriculum, to incorporate technology, to incorporate mandated programs, and to be more visibly accountable—as challenging as they may seem, present us with a valuable opportunity to reexamine our professional lives. If we are to make changes that are harmonious...
with our goals, beliefs, and philosophies, we should first “take stock,” and metaphor is an ideal starting point. As Pugh, Hicks, and Davis suggest in *Metaphorical Ways of Knowing: The Imaginative Nature of Thought and Expression*, metaphors can help us understand “the selves we want to become or despair of becoming . . . the selves we have been and the selves we escaped being” (48). And it can show us the selves we are able to become.

**Metaphors of Two Teachers**

**Candy:** I earned my teaching certificate in a program that stressed induction, problem solving, and what was then known as discovery learning. A teacher was supposed to be structured but not authoritarian, in charge but not dictatorial, the creator of an environment in which students explored and drew their own conclusions. The ideal teacher was not dominant in the day-to-day activities of the classroom, but worked arduously behind the scenes to ensure that students arrived at sound conclusions and received appropriate inspiration from the material. I saw myself as a lighthouse—a beacon guiding my students, the ships, to a safe and rich harbor. Adolescence was a stormy sea. By introducing my seniors to Shakespeare, Keats, and Golding, I would light their way across the treacherous water to a calm, literate adulthood. My students were lost ships in need of a port, and literature and writing were their saviors.

When I look at my teaching today in light of this metaphor, I am struck by how much I believed in my own power and the power of texts. While I still see myself as a guide, I have abandoned authority over the interactions among readers, writers, and texts, having long since converted to reader response and workshop approaches. Students have choice and exercise self-determination; they are sailors capable of charting their own courses, fixing leaks, mending sails. Now I am more inclined to envision myself as a videogame hotline counselor (“You’re stuck on level six? Try these moves.”) or a series of signs in a self-guided tour (“Push this button to hear about . . .”). I am an expert on strategies, a resource in a playful environment that supports exploration and finding one’s own way.

**Cheryl:** When I started teaching I saw myself as the engineer of a train. The Boxcar Queen. I thought that if I assembled a pattern of ideas and strategies, separating the skills into their own compartments, I would create a trustworthy structure. The only links holding these boxes together were the days of the week. On Mondays I gave out the spelling words from a vocabulary workbook for tenth graders. On Tuesdays I worked on identifying subjects and verbs; on using appositives, dependent clauses, and participial phrases; or on varying sentence structure. On Wednesdays I assigned a short story and the questions that accompanied it. On Thursdays I taught writing. On Friday we were ready for the test on Monday’s spelling words and for a reading comprehension test. In sum, it was a fragmented week: I taught separate skills and kept them separate. The only noise a passing administrator might hear was the yawn of a bored student.

---

We have discovered in our workshops that the exercise of creating and analyzing metaphors has many benefits.

Eventually, I derailed that train. I began to see that I viewed learning as a mastery of separate skills. I valued each day’s work, but did not see how I might combine the skills on one given day in a larger framework. Now I am more like a Miles Davis trumpet piece both improvised and structured, using many instruments to meld various tones and skills in the classroom. Structure is still important in this “arrangement,” but now I teach story, language, and writing on the same day. I’m like a jazz trumpeter. I may lead or follow other instruments as we create the score.

**Charting the Journey**

In creating metaphors we clarify our relationships to the people with whom we work and to the teachers we were, are, and want to be. Thinking metaphorically, we articulate assumptions we bring to the classroom: assumptions about teaching, learning, and literacy, and assumptions about power, authority, and community in our classrooms. We have found numerous activities as useful starters for this
journey of self-discovery. Try some of those listed in the sidebar to this article.

Where the Journey Can Lead Us
Is your class like a meal in the school cafeteria, with meat and potatoes to start with and big cookies at the end? Do you see your class as a gourmet restaurant, where people have time to savor carefully prepared meals (books) in a comfortable atmosphere? Perhaps you are a whisk, keeping the talk moving and your students stirred up; a vacuum cleaner, tidying up the irrelevant digressions; or a cherry-pitter, forcing the seeds of good ideas out of your writers.

And what do these metaphors reveal—about your environment, your relationship with your students, your comfort level with administrators? We have discovered in our workshops that the exercise of creating and analyzing metaphors has many benefits.

Metaphors Clarify Our Teaching Practices
Gus, a third-year high school teacher, described his classroom as a fast food restaurant:

I have four different preps. My whole day is moving from one thing to the next, and quickly. Civics one hour, freshman English the next, and so on. In
addition, I coach varsity basketball and have three children at home, with a two-hour commute each day. I am hurried and frazzled. I rush through a whirl of classes, activities, meetings, practices, and games. My life is a burger and a coke, and make that to go.

On exploring this metaphor Gus discovered he felt just as frazzled in his classes—racing through activities to meet objectives and cover the material. He was surprised to realize that his classes were highly teacher-centered, despite his belief in more student-centered learning.

Metaphors Clarify Our Attitudes

Is teaching grammar root canal surgery or a look through a microscope? Melissa, a preservice teacher, found her metaphor for grammar teaching in the place where she lives:

Teaching grammar is like whitewater rafting on the Lochsa in June. The paddles you've handed out are only half in the water, or are simply lying on the bottom of the raft, and the sight of the first small riffles of curling foam set your fellow rafters into screaming fits.

(Interestingly, rafting at high water in June might be dangerous, but it can also be the most exciting time to be on the river. Navigating grammar may promise similar rewards and risks.)

Is teaching writing more like building a bridge or cleaning a messy room? For Ingrid, a veteran high school teacher, it’s like searching for a spring. It reveals her belief in the innate fluency of children:

You can feel it under your feet, see the vegetation that marks its underground path, hear it looking for a way to surface, and suddenly there it is, gurgling up as pure as anything you could have imagined, maybe out of the rocks, maybe from under a rotten log. Sometimes, you just sit down on the wet moss and wait, maybe sing a bit until it finds you.

Teaching literature might seem more like a voyage to Mars (a dangerous adventure into unknown territory) or an adventure in the kitchen, serving up books to be savored. One group of teachers described it as “a hot tub—social, bubbly, inviting, relaxing, intimate, intimidating, steamy, private, too hot for comfort, baptismal, restorative.” Their metaphoric juxtapositions—social/private, inviting/intimidating, secular/spiritual—reveal the complexities and challenges of teaching literature, juxtapositions that could evoke profitable discussion during an in-service workshop. (How do we invite students to read Shakespeare and not intimidate them? How do we teach controversial works that are both “restorative” and “too hot for comfort”? How do we “convert” our students to devoted readers?)

Metaphors Show Us How We Perceive Our Students and Colleagues

[I am] a sturdy flint, ready for little or large stones (students) to rub up against me—pass by and spark or flame.

[I am] a spouse. There is an exchange in the relationship between married couples that should be built upon trust; this trusting relationship should be carried on between the teacher and students.

A flint and a spouse are two very different images of teaching. The first metaphor implies that the teacher is strong, passive unless approached, and a provoker; students must seek her out and use her to ignite their own learning. A spouse, on the other hand, is a collaborator who works in harmony with students, sharing decisions and working with students to create a trusting environment. Implicit in each of these descriptions are concepts of authority, power, and status, and beliefs about how knowledge is constructed or transmitted. Do you draw knowledge out of your students, do you impart it, or both? Do you prescribe drills to strengthen muscles or medicine for ailing minds? Do you respond more to the image of charismatic Mr. Keating of Dead Poets Society or to the fatherly Mr. Chips? Are you protectors, collaborators, or mediums that nourish and fertilize but do not direct growth? And how would you describe your fellow teachers and administrators—as resources and supporters, or obstructors? Do you feel with your principal that you are an answering machine with a cheerful, prerecorded message, or a place-kicker, relied on for the extra point? Is your English department a nest of black widow spiders or a cluster of snowflakes, each separate and distinct?

Examining the nature of professional relationships that our metaphors reveal can be an important step in clarifying how we relate to the educational community. Efron and Bolotin Joseph describe two sets of dichotomies in teachers’ metaphors: 1) the teacher as creative, nurturing artist (play director, actor, orchestra conductor) vs. the
teacher as mechanic keeping the machine running smoothly (manager, train engineer); and 2) the teacher as guiding parent (mother, lighthouse) vs. the teacher as co-learner (big sister, traveler, companion) (57–61). Fischer and Kiefer note similar patterns: Teacher as interpreter, presence, elder, child, advocate, therapist, parent, animator, companion, and storyteller (42–50). Do our metaphors reflect the relationships we truly want to have with students, colleagues, parents, and administrators? Do they reflect the teachers we want to be ten years from now? If not, what can we do to improve these relationships?

Is your English department a nest of black widow spiders or a cluster of snowflakes, each separate and distinct?

Metaphors Are a Springboard for Change

Gus, the teacher who described his class as a fast food restaurant, could see cardiac arrest waiting to happen. When he compared this metaphor to one of his ideal class, a family holiday meal where students shared a buffet of activities they helped create, he began to see the sources of his frustration: the external pressures from his job description; and the internal pressures coming from his perception that he had to be “center stage” in the classroom, that he was the authority in the learning-teaching processes. As a result of this exercise, he began to seek ways to reorganize his classroom, to create an environment in which students were more comfortable and self-sustaining, in greater control of their learning. He investigated and began to adopt strategies such as literature circles and writing workshops that would focus briefly on minilessons he prepared but would otherwise function on their own once the students knew how the approach worked. Addressing the limitations in his first metaphor and comparing it to the second helped him see a way to create a buffet, rich in activity, learning, and camaraderie.

Through Metaphor, We Meet Ourselves

Metaphors are not static, nor are our careers as English teachers. The possibility of change is implicit in the metaphors we create. If the waters are calm and the sailors fit, the lighthouse may dim the light; the engineer may leave the switchyard and head for the jazz club. At any point in our histories we can retrace our journeys, encounter our earlier selves, learn from our evolutions, and chart new journeys. In short, metaphors capture our professional lives as we have woven and created them within and beyond the classroom walls.

The Journey Never Ends

We know you are pressed for time. With all of the pressures placed on you to meet new standards and adopt new programs, there is scant time to focus on your needs for self-reflection and renewal. But remember: daydreaming and thinking like a poet can be just as invigorating and useful as an inservice workshop or a summer school course. In this self-study you are your own teacher and well qualified for this important, at times playful, task.

Work with other members of your department and share your responses to the earlier exercises or the following suggestions. Invite an administrator to join your self-study group. Or take this metaphorical journey by yourself; the elixir you bring back to your classroom and to your teaching life is your reward.

Supplementary Exercises to Try

- Keep a “Teaching History” in which you chart and reflect on key points in your journey as a teacher. You might list these and then create metaphors for them and write about them in your journal. For example, Pugh et al. use water, weather, or seasonal imagery to coax new associations. For weather imagery, associate your key points with a storm (from raindrop to rainbow), a blizzard, the eye of a storm, high pressure fronts and lows, jet stream, changes in direction, zephyr, breeze, and hurricane (86).
- Keep a teaching journal for awhile (a month, a semester, a summer, a year). Explore different metaphors of yourself as a teacher; write about your daily life in the classroom, collect quotes and dialogue from students, and record whatever
will help you focus on yourself professionally. At
the end of this period write a letter to yourself
and explain, through metaphor, where you are
and where you hope to be in three years. Seal
this journal and letter to your future self and
open it at the specified time. You might ask a
family member to keep it and promise to mail
or give it to you when the time comes. Encoun-
tering your former self will be an event worth
waiting for, like finding an old letter you’ve writ-
ten that opens a door to new understanding.

- View films or television dramas about teachers
and create metaphors for the depictions. What
images are projected of teachers generally? Of
the “teacher-hero”? Critique these cultural
metaphors in your journal. Create new images
and metaphors for your profession. How might
you act, direct, and produce a movie or tele-
vision program that exemplifies these new
metaphors? Films to consider: Goodbye, Mr:
Chips; Dead Poets Society; If; Blackboard
Jungle; Up the Down Staircase; Educating Rita;
To Sir, With Love; Dangerous Minds; Stand
and Deliver; Lean On Me; Mr. Holland’s Opus;
Conrack; The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie; Good
Will Hunting.

- In Bridging: A Teacher’s Guide to Metaphorical
Thinking, Pugh et al. suggest creating your own
fantasy and imagining yourself in a different
form. First, see yourself as the teacher you are,
then imagine the teacher you might become—
from a pigeon to a peacock, for example. In
your journal imagine yourself waking up as
someone else, focusing on what you were and
are now becoming. Possibilities: changes in
nature—caterpillar to butterfly, river to a
waterfall; changes in fiction—Clark Kent to Su-
perman or a character of your choice; changes in
perspective—how a closet looks to a cat; imagi-
nary changes—a mouse changing into a cat, a
Republican changing into a Democrat (96).

- Compare problems in your teaching to some-
thing else and imagine not only what the
problems are but also how you might address
them. In Writing with Power, Peter Elbow in-
cludes a list of different ways to resee a problem

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Metaphors for “Teacher”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Actor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Snake-oil maker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art pallet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Card game</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fountain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guide for the blind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Movie director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oak</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rolodex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sculptor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ship captain</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
or dilemma. Do several of these in one sitting: compare your problem to a pump that needs priming, defective materials, a car that won’t start in the winter, a Gordian knot, bad digestion, a mental illness, or too many cooks in the kitchen (91–92).

Works Cited


Fischer, Joseph C., and Anne Kiefer. “Constructing and Discovering Images of Your Teaching.” Bolotin Joseph and Burnaford 29–53.


CANDIDA GILLIS and CHERYL L. JOHNSON teach in the English Department at the University of Idaho, Moscow.

EJ 75 years ago

Studying the Life of a Fiction Writer

“The writer of fiction is no different from the rest of human kind, except to the degree to which his emotional susceptibility is more heightened and his senses more discerning. He does not possess a different set of mental processes mysteriously comprehended in that word ‘genius.’ Anyone may learn in varying degree the novelist’s analysis of character or the short-story writer’s appreciation of situations. It is a perverted educational emphasis, indeed, which denies the value of teaching students to understand life with some of the acumen of the fiction writer.”


Censorship Exhibit

When planning your exhibits for Banned Books Week in September, you may wish to consider including the 2002–2003 edition of the exhibit Censorship in Schools and Libraries, published by the Long Island Coalition Against Censorship. This history highlights incidents of censorship that have occurred in the United States during the last one hundred years, including descriptions of the censorship of Adventures of Huckleberry Finn, In the Night Kitchen, The Catcher in the Rye, and the novels of Judy Blume and Robert Cormier. US Supreme Court and lower court decisions are an integral part of the exhibit.

The new edition includes efforts to censor the popular Harry Potter children’s books (in December 2001, Harry Potter books were burned in Alamagordo, New Mexico), and the installation of filtering software in all the computers in the Loudon County, Virginia, Public Library. In addition to new cases, there is an update of censorship incidents in libraries and schools that occurred throughout the 1990s.

For additional information, send an e-mail to coalcen@juno.com or write to the Long Island Coalition Against Censorship, Donald Parker, Co-coordinator, PO Box 296, Port Washington, NY 11050.